## STATE OF NORTH CAROLINA OFFICE OF THE STATE AUDITOR BETH A. WOOD, CPA



# TOWN OF MANTEO

MANTEO, NORTH CAROLINA

INVESTIGATIVE REPORT DECEMBER 2019





### **PURPOSE**

The Office of the State Auditor received multiple, varied allegations through its Hotline concerning the Doughs Creek Canal dredging project. During the investigation of the initial allegations, concerns were also identified regarding a Town of Manteo (Town) Commissioner using state funds for his personal benefit.

#### BACKGROUND

The Town of Manteo is located on Roanoke Island in Dare County, North Carolina. It is the county seat of Dare County. The Town is a municipal corporation that is governed by an elected mayor and six commissioners. The Town provides general government services including police, public works, planning and zoning, and water and sewer services.

The Town began the Doughs Creek Canal dredging project in November 2017 and concluded it in August 2018. The project, which cost approximately \$743,000, involved:

- Dredging the Doughs Creek Canal.
- Barging the dredged material (sediment, debris, etc.) from the canal to a transfer site.
- Trucking the dredged material from the transfer site to the Town's public works site.

To obtain the transfer site, the Town leased two adjacent parcels of privately-owned land for \$50,000. Separate limited liability companies owned these parcels of land.

#### FINDINGS

- Town Commissioner derived direct benefit of \$12,500 from a contract related to the Doughs Creek Canal dredging project.
- Town Finance Officer did not ensure that expenditures were reasonable and necessary.

#### RECOMMENDATIONS

- The Town's Board of Commissioners should seek repayment from the Commissioner for the proceeds received that were associated with the Doughs Creek Canal dredging project.
- The Town Manager should take appropriate disciplinary action against the Finance Officer.
- The Town Manager should provide additional training to ensure all Town employees understand and comply with the established policies and procedures.
- The Town's Board of Commissioners should consider seeking repayment of \$12,500 paid to the former Mayor's corporation given the lack of documentation that services invoiced as "Third Party Observer" were reasonable, necessary, or actually performed.

### state of North Carolina Office of the State Auditor



Beth A. Wood, CPA State Auditor 2 S. Salisbury Street 20601 Mail Service Center Raleigh, NC 27699-0600 Telephone: (919) 807-7500 Fax: (919) 807-7647 https://www.auditor.nc.gov

## **AUDITOR'S TRANSMITTAL**

The Honorable Roy Cooper, Governor Members of the North Carolina General Assembly Bobby Owens, Mayor, Town of Manteo

Ladies and Gentlemen:

Pursuant to North Carolina General Statutes \$147-64.6(c)(16) and \$147-64.6B, we have completed an investigation of allegations concerning the Town of Manteo. The results of our investigation, along with recommendations for corrective action, are contained in this report.

Copies of this report have been provided to the Governor, the Attorney General, and other appropriate officials in accordance with G.S. \$147-64.6(c)(12). We appreciate the cooperation received from the management and employees of the Town of Manteo during our investigation.

Respectfully submitted,

Seel A. Wood

Beth A. Wood, CPA State Auditor



Beth A. Wood, CPA State Auditor

## TABLE OF CONTENTS

### PAGE

BACKGROUND 1
FINDING AND RECOMMENDATIONS
<ol> <li>TOWN COMMISSIONER DERIVED DIRECT BENEFIT OF \$12,500 FROM A CONTRACT RELATED TO THE DOUGHS CREEK CANAL DREDGING PROJECT</li></ol>
2. TOWN FINANCE OFFICER DID NOT ENSURE EXPENDITURES WERE REASONABLE AND NECESSARY
APPENDIX
RESPONSE FROM THE TOWN OF MANTEO
ORDERING INFORMATION

Article 5A, Chapter 147 of the *North Carolina General Statutes*, gives the Auditor broad powers to examine all books, records, files, papers, documents, and financial affairs of every state agency and any organization that receives public funding. The Auditor also has the power to summon people to produce records and to answer questions under oath.



# BACKGROUND

The Office of the State Auditor received multiple, varied allegations through its Hotline concerning the Doughs Creek Canal dredging project. During the investigation of the initial allegations, concerns were also identified regarding a Town of Manteo (Town) Commissioner using state funds for his personal benefit.

Our investigation of this allegation included the following procedures:

- Review of applicable North Carolina General Statutes and Town policies and procedures.
- Examination and analysis of available documents and records related to the allegations.
- Interviews with the current Town mayor, a former Town mayor, commissioners, employees, vendors, and North Carolina Department of Environmental Quality officials.

This report presents the results of the investigation. The investigation was conducted pursuant to *North Carolina General Statutes* §147-64.6 (c)(16) and §147-64.6B.

The Town of Manteo is located on Roanoke Island in Dare County, North Carolina. It is the county seat of Dare County. The Town is a municipal corporation that is governed by an elected mayor and six commissioners. The Town provides general government services including police, public works, planning and zoning, and water and sewer services.

The Town began the Doughs Creek Canal dredging project in November 2017 and concluded it in August 2018. The project, which cost approximately \$743,000, involved:

- Dredging the Doughs Creek Canal.
- Barging the dredged material (sediment, debris, etc.) from the canal to a transfer site.
- Trucking the dredged material from the transfer site to the Town's public works site.

To obtain the transfer site, the Town leased two adjacent parcels of privately-owned land for \$50,000. Separate limited liability companies owned these parcels of land.



# FINDINGS AND RECOMMENDATIONS

#### 1. TOWN COMMISSIONER DERIVED DIRECT BENEFIT OF \$12,500 FROM A CONTRACT RELATED TO THE DOUGHS CREEK CANAL DREDGING PROJECT

A Town of Manteo (Town) Commissioner derived a direct financial benefit from a contract he was involved in making or administering. As a result, the Town may have overpaid for the contract and the Town Commissioner may have violated state statutes. The Town Commissioner was able to derive a direct benefit because he failed to disclose his conflict of interest. State law and a Town ordinance prohibit Town officials from benefiting from contracts.

#### Town Commissioner Derived Direct Benefit from Contract

A Town Commissioner (Commissioner) was able to derive a direct financial benefit from a contract he was involved in making or administering for the Doughs Creek Canal dredging<sup>1</sup> project. To obtain the transfer site for the dredging project, the Town leased<sup>2</sup> two adjacent parcels of land owned by separate limited liability companies for \$50,000.

The Commissioner was involved in making the lease agreement and ultimately received \$12,500 from the project. The Commissioner:

- Voted on and motioned to approve the \$50,000 budget amendment<sup>3</sup> for the lease of the parcels of land.
- Signed as the agent for the limited liability companies on the Town of Manteo vendor applications. These applications were required before payment could be issued.
- Received a payment of \$12,500 (25% of the \$50,000 budgeted to lease the parcels of land).

The Commissioner and a former mayor of the Town of Manteo (former Mayor) described the \$12,500 payment as a "gift." On December 22, 2017, the former Mayor wrote a \$12,500 check from his corporation's bank account to the Commissioner. This payment occurred the day after the former Mayor's corporation received \$25,000 from the Town for the Doughs Creek Canal dredging project.<sup>4</sup>

#### May Have Resulted in Overpayment and Violation of State Statutes

The Town may have overpaid for the use of the parcels of land because \$12,500 of the \$50,000 payment went to the Commissioner. Any overpayment reduced the Town's ability to fund other projects.

Additionally, the Commissioner may have violated state statutes.

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>1</sup> "Dredging is the removal of sediments and debris from the bottom of lakes, rivers, harbors, and other water bodies. It is a routine necessity in waterways around the world because sedimentation—the natural process of sand and silt washing downstream—gradually fills channels and harbors." Source: National Ocean Service

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>2</sup> Town officials were unable to provide a written contract to investigators.

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>3</sup> Budget Amendment #3 included a \$50,000 line item described as "Third Party Observer/Lease of Klimkiewicz Property." The amendment was passed at the Town of Manteo Board of Commissioners meeting on October 18, 2017.

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>4</sup> On December 21, 2017, the former Mayor's corporation received \$25,000 from the Town for his involvement as the "Third Party Observer" in the lease of the parcels of land.

#### Caused by Failure to Disclose Conflict of Interest

The Commissioner derived a direct benefit from the lease agreement by failing to disclose his conflict of interest. No Town employees or officials knew that the Commissioner would receive a payment related to the dredging project.

The former Mayor told investigators that the \$12,500 payment from his corporation to the Commissioner was a "gift." He said, "Let me be clear, that money was all given to me, and I am allowed to spend my money in any way I see fit and for whatever reason I see fit." He added that the \$12,500 payment to the Commissioner "is not public knowledge.... because people would start connecting it to [the Commissioner] got paid for some of this dredging project."

#### State Law and Town Ordinance Prohibited Benefiting from Contract

*North Carolina General Statute* §14-234 specifies conflict of interest provisions for public officers benefiting from public contracts. Specifically, this law makes it a Class 1 misdemeanor for a government official or employee who is involved in making or administering a contract to derive a direct benefit from that contract.

Additionally, *Town of Manteo Code of Ordinances*, Section 2-39, provides that "No town officer shall have any personal interest in any town contract relating to the providing of materials or services to the town...."

#### RECOMMENDATION

The Town's Board of Commissioners should seek repayment from the Commissioner for the proceeds received that were associated with the Doughs Creek Canal dredging project.

Note: This finding referred to the District Attorney for the First Prosecutorial District to determine if there is sufficient evidence to pursue criminal charges related to the direct benefits derived.

## 2. TOWN FINANCE OFFICER DID NOT ENSURE EXPENDITURES WERE REASONABLE AND NECESSARY

The Town of Manteo's (Town) Finance Officer did not ensure that documentation existed to support the reasonableness and necessity of three expenditures totaling \$50,000. As a result, the Town may have overpaid for the lease of the parcels of land for the Doughs Creek Canal dredging<sup>5</sup> project. The Finance Officer failed to follow policies before approving the invoices submitted by a former mayor of the Town of Manteo (former Mayor). Town policies required the Finance Officer to ensure that all expenditures are adequately documented, reasonable, and necessary.

#### No Documentation to Ensure Expenditures Were Reasonable and Necessary

The Finance Officer issued three payments totaling \$50,000 without adequate supporting documentation. The Finance Officer made these payments in the absence of a written contract

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>5</sup> "Dredging is the removal of sediments and debris from the bottom of lakes, rivers, harbors, and other water bodies. It is a routine necessity in waterways around the world because sedimentation—the natural process of sand and silt washing downstream—gradually fills channels and harbors." Source: National Ocean Service

specifying terms and conditions, services to be provided, and amounts to be paid. In addition, the invoices lacked sufficient detail to determine the services provided.

To obtain the transfer site for the dredging project, the Town leased two adjacent parcels of land owned by separate limited liability companies for \$50,000. However, Town officials were unable to provide a written contract to investigators because only a verbal agreement existed with the limited liability companies.

The Finance Officer did not question the lack of a written contract when adding the \$50,000 to a budget amendment the Board of Commissioners approved on October 18, 2017. The budget amendment contained the description, "Third Party Observer/ Lease of Klimkiewicz property." No information identified the "Third Party Observer" or explained the reasonableness and necessity of the services that the "Third Party Observer" should provide the Town.

On December 19, 2017, the "Third Party Observer," who is a former Mayor, presented three invoices totaling \$50,000 to the Finance Officer. All three invoices<sup>6</sup> were identified as "Invoice #1" and were identical except for the payee and the amount:

- One invoice for \$25,000 from the former Mayor's corporation.
- One invoice for \$12,500 from the limited liability company owning the first parcel of land.
- One invoice for \$12,500 from the limited liability company owning the second parcel of land.

The Finance Officer then issued checks to the designated payees without any documentation to substantiate the reasonableness and necessity of the expenditures. Specifically, the Finance Officer:

- Issued three checks totaling \$50,000 for the use of the parcels of land without adequate documentation to support the time and effort by the "Third Party Observer" or any justification for splitting the \$50,000 between three different payees. The Finance Officer asked the Town's environmental consulting firm about paying the invoices. The environmental consulting firm recommended paying the invoices simply because the three invoices totaled \$50,000 which agreed to the budgeted amount.
- Issued one of the three checks (\$25,000) to a corporation owned by the former Mayor. The former Mayor acted as the "Third Party Observer" without documentation to show that the services were reasonable, necessary, or actually performed.

#### Resulted in Overpayment

The Town may have overpaid for the lease of the parcels of land used during the Doughs Creek dredging project. The Town paid \$50,000 for the use of the land; however, only \$25,000 of that amount was paid to the landowners. The remaining \$25,000 was split between the former Mayor and a Town Commissioner (Commissioner).

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>6</sup> See Appendix A for redacted copies of all three invoices submitted by the former Mayor.

#### Caused by Finance Officer's Failure to Follow Policy

The Finance Officer disregarded the Town's policies and procedures that were intended to safeguard public funds. The Finance Officer told investigators she processed payments without adequate documentation because:

- She had worked with the former Mayor.
- The \$50,000 expenditure matched the approved budget amendment.
- The environmental consulting firm approved the \$50,000 expenditure "based on the understanding that the \$50,000.00 cost ... was accounted for in the Doughs Creek Canal Dredge Project Budget as approved by the state."

In addition, the Finance Officer approved the vendor applications<sup>7</sup> for each of the limited liability companies on December 19, 2017 without questioning that the Commissioner signed as "agent" on both applications.

#### Town Policy Provides Guidance for Processing Invoices

The *Town of Manteo Finance Policies & Procedures* manual provides guidance for approving, processing, and paying invoices. The policies stipulate that:

- "All expenditures from Town Funds must be reasonable and necessary for carrying out the programs and activities of the Town, and are to be documented in a way that clearly substantiates such reasonableness and necessity."
- "For all potential expenditures from all sources of funds, the 'appearance test' should be used, i.e., how would this purchase look to external constituents if placed on the front page of a newspaper."
- "It is the policy of the Town of Manteo...to conduct business in such a manner as to foster public confidence in the integrity of the Town of Manteo."

Expenditures require certain documentation including the original invoice from the vendor, evidence of receipt of services and dates provided, and other pertinent information required to document the expenditure.

#### RECOMMENDATIONS

The Town Manager should take appropriate disciplinary action against the Finance Officer.

The Town Manager should provide additional training to ensure all Town employees understand and comply with the established policies and procedures.

The Town's Board of Commissioners should consider seeking repayment of \$12,500 paid to the former Mayor's corporation given the lack of documentation that services invoiced as "Third Party Observer" were reasonable, necessary, or actually performed.

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>7</sup> The Town of Manteo Finance Policies & Procedures manual requires vendor applications for all new vendors before the Town can issue payment.



# **APPENDIX**

### Invoice #1 (1 of 3): Invoice for \$25,000 from the former Mayor's corporation

	INV	OICI
Manteo NC 27954 INVOICE	#	mber 19, 20 ewicz Prope
Bill To: Town of Manteo 407 Budleigh St. Manteo NC 27954 252.473.2133		
DESCRIPTION	1	MOUNT
Third Party Lease / Observation Klimkiewicz Property		
Roanoke Island Festival Park Dredging Project	\$	25,000.0
	-	
	-	

Invoice #1 (2 of 3): Invoice for \$12,500 from the limited liability company owning the first parcel of land

	-	NVOICE	
Virginia Beach VA. 23454	INVOICE #	December 19, 20	
Bill To: Town of Manteo 407 Budleigh St. Manteo NC 27954 252,473,2133			
DESCRIPTION		AMOUNT	
Third Party Lease / Observation Klimkiewicz Property			
Roanoke Island Festival Park Dredging Project		\$ 12,500.0	

Invoice #1 (3 of 3): Invoice for \$12,500 from the limited liability company owning the second parcel of land.

INVO	
DATE: December INVOICE # FOR: Klimkiewicz	Virginia Beach VA. 23454
	Bill To: Town of Manteo 407 Budleigh St. Manteo NC 27954 252.473.2133
RIPTION AMOU	DESCRIPTION
ion Klimkiewicz Property	Third Party Lease / Observation Klimkiewicz Pro
x Dredging Project \$ 12	Roanoke Island Festival Park Dredging Project



# RESPONSE FROM THE TOWN OF MANTEO



December 11, 2019

VIA OVERNIGHT MAIL AND EMAIL (Jennifer\_Myers@ncauditor.net; Barry\_Long@ncauditor.net; Kevin\_Thomas@ncauditor.net; Donna\_Allen@ncauditor.net)

The Honorable Beth A. Wood, State Auditor Office of the State Auditor 2 S. Salisbury Street 20601 Mail Service Center Raleigh, NC 27699-0601

Dear State Auditor Wood:

Please accept this letter as the Town of Manteo's response to your letter of December 5, 2019. The Board of Commissioners for the Town of Manteo ("**Board**") has reviewed the draft Investigative Report ("**Report**") that you provided and met on December 10, 2019 to determine the Town's plan of action going forward, as follows:

#### PREAMBLE

The Board takes the allegations of the Office of the State Auditor very seriously and is committed to appropriate corrective action within the Town's power and allowable by law. The Town intends to continue its full cooperation with the State Auditor and any law enforcement agency to ensure that public resources have been properly utilized. The Board appreciates the opportunity to respond to the Report. Except as otherwise defined, capitalized terms used in this letter have the same meaning as those appearing in the Report.

I. Lease Transaction Was Negotiated and Approved

The lease agreement for the dredge spoils transfer site ("Lease") for the Dough's Creek Canal dredging project ("**Project**") was negotiated by the Town Manager, the third-party project engineer, and the party identified in the Report as "former Mayor," who was serving as local agent ("Agent") of the land owner. Agent was not an appointed or elected official at the time of the transaction.

Town of Manteo, P. O. Box 246, Manteo, NC 27954 Phone: 252-473-2133 Fax: 252-473-2135 <u>www.townofmanteo.com</u> The negotiated term of the Lease was 120 days with a payment amount of \$50,000, and the Town agreed to restore the site following completion of the Project. The budget appropriation for the Lease was approved by the Board of Commissioners in open session on October 18, 2017, and the restoration requirement of the Lease was included in the Project documents.

#### II. Board Will Request Return of Disbursed Funds

Irrespective of the factual predicate for the Lease, the Board intends to honor the recommendation of the State Auditor and request repayment from Agent and Commissioner of the \$25,000 received by Agent. Any funds received by the Town will be returned to the funding sources from which they were derived. The time frame for transmittal of the repayment request letter shall be within ten (10) business days of publication of the final State Auditor's Report, and the responsible parties for issuing the request shall be the Town Manager and Town Attorney.

#### III. Agent and Commissioner Are No Longer Appointed or Elected

Neither Agent nor Commissioner are currently appointed or elected officials of the Town.

#### IV. Conflict of Interest Training for Elected and Appointed Officials

The Board will implement a conflict of interest and ethics training program for its appointed and elected officials. The time frame for completion of the program will be on or before August 31, 2020 and the responsible parties for organization and scheduling of the program will be the Town Manager and Town Attorney.

#### V. Finance Officer Disciplinary Process

The Town's investigation into the actions of the Finance Officer, as detailed in the Report, is an open, ongoing matter and is in its preliminary phases. This investigation will include, among other things, the Finance Officer's compliance with the Town's internal Finance Policies and Procedures and the Town's Personnel Policy. Discipline of any Town employee, including the Finance Officer, is strictly governed by the following Articles of the Personnel Policy: Article VIII. ("Separation and Reinstatement"), Article IX. ("Unsatisfactory Job Performance and Detrimental Personal Conduct") and Article X. ("Grievance Procedure and Adverse Action Appeal"). As a municipal employee, the Finance Officer is afforded limited procedural rights under the Personnel Policy and may also be afforded rights under the North Carolina State Constitution's Bill of Rights, which safeguards the fruits of a public employee's labor, as mandated by the North Carolina Supreme Court. A deviation from the Town's policies and procedures governing these processes could potentially expose the Town to various employmentbased legal claims, including claims under the North Carolina State Constitution. The completion of the Town's investigative and disciplinary processes will be governed by the Personnel Policy and a completion date cannot currently be definitively stated, but the process will begin within ten (10) business days of publication of the final State Auditor's Report, under the supervision of the Town Manager.

> Town of Manteo, P. O. Box 246, Manteo, NC 27954 Phone: 252-473-2133 Fax: 252-473-2135 www.townofmanteo.com

#### VI. Town Policies and Procedures

The Report recommends that the "Town Manager should provide additional training to ensure all Town employees understand and comply with the established policies and procedures." This action is already underway and is ongoing. Starting in February 2019 (shortly after the new Town Manager's start date of February 11, 2019), the Town Manager embarked on a multi-part approach to compliance with Federal law, State statutes, and local ordinances and policies. First, the Town Manager has provided direction and coaching to staff on compliance and procedural activities including, but not limited to, finance topics ranging from procurement to payroll. Second, the Town Manager has involved department heads and other staff in identifying and proposing solutions to policy conflicts, procedural issues, and compliance needs for all Town policies, including six separate policy review sessions with senior staff. Third, the Town Manager has sought technical assistance from professionals including, but not limited to, the North Carolina League of Municipalities ("NCLM") and the School of Government at UNC-Chapel Hill for the review and updating of policies and procedures, some of which date back 15-20 years, and has already met with NCLM to start the process for policy assistance. Fourth, although the review and update process for the various Town policies is expected to continue into 2020, the Town Manager has already initiated individual training activities for specified staff, plus planning is underway for group training activities applicable to all employees. As noted previously, the training & development program is ongoing, and training on new and updated policies and procedures will be rolled out upon implementation of those policies. In the meantime, the Town Manager will be responsible for development of compliance training under the currently established policies and procedures, and the target date for completion of the training plan will be March 31, 2020 with completion of the first round of training activitics for all employees by September 30, 2020.

The Town appreciates your Office's comprehensive review of this important matter. Please do not hesitate to contact me if you have any questions or require additional information.

Sincerely. l 2 dy 2

James Ayers Town Manager

cc: Mayor Bobby Owens Board of Commissioners

> Town of Manteo, P. O. Box 246, Manteo, NC 27954 Phone: 252-473-2133 Fax: 252-473-2135 www.townofmanteo.com

## **ORDERING INFORMATION**

### COPIES OF THIS REPORT MAY BE OBTAINED BY CONTACTING:

Office of the State Auditor State of North Carolina 2 South Salisbury Street 20601 Mail Service Center Raleigh, North Carolina 27699-0600

Telephone: 919-807-7500 Facsimile: 919-807-7647 Internet: <u>https://www.auditor.nc.gov</u>

To report alleged incidents of fraud, waste or abuse in state government contact the Office of the State Auditor Fraud Hotline: **1-800-730-8477** or download our free app.



https://play.google.com/store/apps/details?id=net.ncstateauditor.ncauditor&hl=en\_US



https://itunes.apple.com/us/app/nc-state-auditor-hotline/id567315745

For additional information, contact the North Carolina Office of the State Auditor at 919-807-7666



This investigation required 938 hours at an approximate cost of \$96,614.